With all my heart I review the paper entitled "Alterations in aggregate characteristics of thermally heated water-repellent soilaggregates under laboratory conditions" by

Basically, this research is meaningful in soil physics to see the effect of forest fires on soil aggregates where soil aggregates affect soil erosion. The language is pretty good. However, this paper still lacks data. and soil samples that need improvement.

Main comments see below:

# **1.INTROUCTION**

1. It is important to convey the fact that forest fires have caused damage to soil aggregates which have increased soil erodibility and thus affected soil erosion.

2. Forest fires in the field have an impact on soil erosion which according to the USLE model of soil erosion the formula A = RKLSCP. Soil Aggregate generally affects K Factor (Soil erodibility). It is urgent to explain the role of this SWR soil aggregate on K-Factor

3. It is very important to convey the hypothesis about the factors that affect SWR and WSA on soil aggregates in the form of granular, blocky and prismatic soil structures.

# MATERIAL AND METHOD

4. It is very important to describe the research location on a map. Soil sampling at a depth of 0-5 cm, 5-10 cm, 10-15 cm, 15-20 cm and 20-25 cm is good because the soil aggregates are equally granular and the organic matter content is still high. However, with soil BD = 1 g/cm3 then the dry weight of 1 ha = 2500 tons/ha. It means that in field conditions, if the forest is burned, the forest soil is that heavy, the rain will disappear within a year. associated with very high erosion will occur after forest fires. It is very important to take soil samples at a depth of 25-50 cm, 50-75 cm, 75-100 cm.

5. It is important to take soil samples at different locations with different vegetation. In order to find soil aggregates with granular soil structure, sub angular bloky or bloky and prismatic.

6. It is very important to display photos of soil aggregates before burning and after burning at different temperatures. You can also use a microscope magnification

**RESULT AND DISCUSSION** 

7. It would be better if the data contained soil characteristics to a depth of 1 meter with soil aggregates of granular, blocky and prismatic. It is very important to test under different vegetation conditions.

8. Calculation of soil erodibility value (K-Factor) after burning soil aggregates on a laboratory scale if possible is very important.

9. With the addition of new data, the conclusions are very important to be revised

Alterations in aggregate characteristics of thermally heated water-repellent soil aggregates under laboratory conditions

Original Submission AflizarAflizar

**Overall Manuscript Rating (1 - 100): 45** 

Transfer Authorization	Response
My reviewer report is complete.	Yes
I am ready to transfer my reviewer report to the Editors.	Yes
If this submission is transferred to another publication with "Open Peer Review", do we have your consent to publish your review in a pre-publication history?	No

### **Reviewer Comments to Author**

With all my heart I review the paper entitled "Alterations in aggregate characteristics of thermally heated water-repellent soil aggregates under laboratory conditions" by HTM Perera, DAL Leelamanie, Morihiro Maeda, Yasushi Mori

Basically, this research is meaningful in soil physics to see the effect of forest fires on soil aggregates where soil aggregates affect soil erosion. The language is pretty good. However, this paper still lacks data. and soil samples that need improvement.

Main comments see below:

#### 1.INTROUCTION

1. It is important to convey the fact that forest fires have caused damage to soil aggregates which have increased soil erodibility and thus affected soil erosion.

2. Forest fires in the field have an impact on soil erosion which according to the USLE model of soil erosion the formula A = RKLSCP. Soil Aggregate generally affects K Factor (Soil erodibility). It is urgent to explain the role of this SWR soil aggregate on K-Factor

3. It is very important to convey the hypothesis about the factors that affect SWR and WSA on soil aggregates in the form of granular, blocky and prismatic soil structures.

#### MATERIAL AND METHOD

4. It is very important to describe the research location on a map. Soil sampling at a depth of 0-5 cm, 5-10 cm, 10-15 cm, 15-20 cm and 20-25 cm is good because the soil aggregates are equally granular and the organic matter content is still high. However, with soil BD = 1 g/cm3 then the dry weight of 1 ha = 2500 tons/ha. It means that in field conditions, if the forest is burned, the forest soil is that heavy, the rain will disappear within a year. associated with very high erosion will occur after forest fires. It is very important to take soil samples at a depth of 25-50 cm, 50-75 cm, 75-100 cm.

5. It is important to take soil samples at different locations with different vegetation. In order to find soil aggregates with granular soil structure, sub angular bloky or bloky and prismatic.

6. It is very important to display photos of soil aggregates before burning and after burning at different temperatures. You can also use a microscope magnification

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

7. It would be better if the data contained soil characteristics to a depth of 1 meter with soil aggregates of granular, blocky and prismatic. It is very important to test under different vegetation conditions.

8. Calculation of soil erodibility value (K-Factor) after burning soil aggregates on a laboratory scale if possible is very important.

9. With the addition of new data, the conclusions are very important to be revised

## **Reviewer Confidential Comments to Editor:**

Question 1: The subject addressed in this article is worthy of investigation 1) Strongly disagree 2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 3) Neutral

Question 2: The information presented is new 1) Strongly disagree

2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 3) Neutral Question 3: The conclusions are supported by the data 1) Strongly disagree 2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 3) Neutral Question 4: The manuscript is appropriate for the journal 1) Strongly disagree 2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 3) Neutral Question 5: Organization of the manuscript is appropriate 1) Strongly disagree 2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 2) Disagree Question 6: Figures, tables and supplementary data are appropriate 1) Strongly disagree 2) Disagree 3) Neutral 4) Agree 5) Strongly agree Ans: 2) Disagree

# **Attachments:**

Action	Description	File Name
Download		engglishreviweragregate geoderma.docx

- $ ightarrow$ $C$ $ ilde{B}$ reviewerhub	.elsevier.com/reviews/history/GEODER		le ☆ ≱ □ 🤁
Reviewer Hut	)		(
eviews	Reviews > History > Geoderma		
Invitations	Your completed reviews - Geoderma		
n progress	5 reviews completed		Recognised Reviewer Certificate
listory			L]
eview preferences 🛛 🔍			
opus profile	Manuscript title 🔻	Date completed 💌	Revision
	Spatial Distribution of Ephemeral Gullies and its Influencing Factors: a     Regional Scale Study	17th December 2021	0 Actions <b>v</b>
a	Characteristics of agricultural phosphorus migration loss in different purple soil layers on sloping cropland under natural rainfall conditions	13th December 2021	0 Actions <b>v</b>
SEVIER pyright © 2022 Elsevier rms and Conditions	Transfer functions for phosphorus and potassium soil tests and implications for the QUEFTS model	24th May 2021	1 Activate Wind <u>ows</u>
Contraction of the second s			
	÷ 6 6 6 6 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		Go to Settings to activate Windows.
e use cookies to help provide and	iencari 🔬 O 🛱 🗃 🖻 🔲 🍓	Cesktop *	▲ 29℃ へ 登 町 4% ENG 07/10/2022
⊇ (1 unread) - aflizar_melafu@yahı	iencari 🔬 O 🛱 🗃 🖻 🔲 🍓	Dicistrop "Desktop "	2 2000 A D FT dw FM C 11:00
e use cookies to help provide and	iencari O H I C Editorial Manager® X G GOC		▲ 29℃ へ 登 駅 4% ENG 07/10/2022
e use cookies to help provide and	iencari O H I C Editorial Manager® X G GOC		▲ 29℃ へ 登 駅 4% ENG 07/10/2022
use cookies to help provide and  C Ketik di sini untuk m  (I unread) - efilzar_melafu@yeh  C @ reviewerhub  Reviewer Hub  views	iencari 🛛 💽 O H 🙃 🔄 🗔 😸 🌚 🌚		▲ 29°C へ 登 型 40 ENG 07/10/2022 ✓ - 団 全 全 金 第 日 40 ENG 07/10/2022
use cookies to help provide and Ketik di sini untuk m (1 unread) - aflizar, melafu@yahi C  Reviewer Hutt Reviewer Hutt views nvitations n progress	eencari O El I C I Editorial Manager® X G GOO x E Your completed reviews - Esevic X A Editorial Manager® X G GOO elsevier.com/reviews/history/GEODER 5 reviews completed Manuscript title •	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur X   +	29°C A D P A BNG 07/10/2022
use cookies to help provide and  Ketik di sini untuk m  Ketik di si	Image: Spatial Distribution of Ephemeral Gullies and its Influencing Factors: a	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur X   +	29°C A D P A BNG 07/10/2022
use cookies to help provide and Ketik di sini untuk m  (1 unread) - aflizar, melafu@yah  C  Reviewer Hut  Wiews Nvitations In progress  History Wiew preferences NView profile	Image: Pour completed reviews - Elsevic: X     X   E   Your completed reviews - Elsevic: X   A   E ditional Manager®   X   C   C   C   C   C   C   Manuscript title *   Spatial Distribution of Ephemeral Gullies and its Influencing Factors: a   Regional Scale Study   Characteristics of agricultural phosphorus migration loss in different purple	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur X +	29°C A D THOO OTTOURDER 29°C A D THOO OTTOURDER V - O C A D THOO OTTOURDER V - O C A D THOO OTTOURDER Itoo Itoo OTTOURDER Itoo Itoo OTTOURDER Itoo Ito
use cookies to help provide and Ketik di sini untuk m (1 unread) - aflizar, melafu@yahi C  after reviewer Hutt Reviewer Hutt Reviewer Hutt views Reviewer Hutt views hytitations n progress History view preferences opus profile wards & Reports	encari       Image: Image	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur X + Date completed ¥ 17th December 2021	29°C ∧ ⊕ 및 ④ ENG 07/10/2022 ∨ - ♥ ⊯ ☆ ★ ■ € Recognised Reviewer Certificate Revision
use cookies to help provide and  Ketik di sini untuk m  Reviewer Hutt  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Provide and  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Provide and  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Provide and  Keviewer Provide and  Keviewer Hutt  Keviewer Provide and  Keviewer Pr	Image: Pour completed reviews - Elsevic: X     X   E   Your completed reviews - Elsevic: X   A   E ditional Manager®   X   C   C   C   C   C   C   Manuscript title *   Spatial Distribution of Ephemeral Gullies and its Influencing Factors: a   Regional Scale Study   Characteristics of agricultural phosphorus migration loss in different purple	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur X + Date completed ¥ 17th December 2021	29°C ∧ ⊕ 및 (1) ENG 07/10/2022 ∨ - O ⊯ ☆ ★ □ ↔ Recognised Reviewer Certificate
use cookies to help provide and Ketik di sini untuk m (1 unread) - aflizar, melafu@yahi C  aflizar, melafu@yahi C  aflizar, melafu@yahi Reviewer Hutt Wews Reviewer Hutt Wews Notitations In progress History Wew preferences New Wew preferences New Notice and a Reports New	encari O H I	DGLE TRANSLATE - Penelusur × + Date completed × 17th December 2021 13th December 2021	29°C ○ □ 11.00   29°C ○ □ □   29°C ○ □ □   20°C □ □ □   20°C □ □ □   20°C □ □ □   20°C □ □ □   0 □ □ □   0 □ □ □

https://reviewerhub.elsevier.com/reviews/history/GEODER

5

